

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter I

General Introduction

1.1.	Scope of the Thesis	1
1.2.	The Relevance of the Right to Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion	6
1.3.	The Need for a Dynamic Interpretation of the Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion	10
1.4.	The Structure of the Study	12

PART ONE:

INDIVIDUAL ASPECTS OF THE FREEDOM OF THOUGHT, CONSCIENCE AND RELIGION	17
---	----

Chapter II

The Freedom to Have or to Change One's Religion or Belief

2.1.	The Codification of the Right to Freedom to Have or to Change One's Religion or Belief	19
2.1.1.	General Description	19
2.1.2.	Which Religions or Beliefs are Meant to be Covered?	20
2.1.2.1.	Three Approaches	20
2.1.2.2.	Examination of the Basic Texts	23
2.1.2.3.	The Three Approaches throughout the Codification Process	24
2.1.2.4.	The Expression 'whatever belief' in the Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of Intolerance and of Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief	29
2.1.3.	The Right to Change One's Religion or Belief	34
2.1.3.1.	Arguments in Favour of the Right to Change One's Religion or Belief	34
2.1.3.2.	Arguments against the Right to Change One's Religion or Belief	35
2.1.3.3.	The Significance of the Recognition of the Right to Change One's Religion or Belief in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights	38
2.1.3.4.	The Freedom to Change one's Religion or Belief in More Recent Human Rights Instruments	44
a.	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	44

Table of Contents

b.	The Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of Intolerance and of Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief	48
2.1.4.	The Right of Minors to Have Their Own Religion or Belief	51
2.1.5.	The Absolute Character of the Freedom to Have or to Change a Religion or Belief	55
2.1.6.	Concluding observations	61
2.2.	The Freedom to Have or to Change One's Religion or Belief in Practice	61
2.2.1.	Introduction	61
2.2.2.	The Scope of 'Religion or Belief'	62
2.2.3.	The Interpretation of 'Freedom from Coercion'	63
2.2.4.	The Rights of Minors	69
2.2.5.	The Absolute Character of the Freedom to Have or to Change One's Religion or Belief	71
2.2.6.	Concluding Observations	74

Chapter III

The Freedom to Manifest One's Religion or Belief

3.1.	The Codification of the Freedom to Manifest One's Religion or Belief	77
3.1.1.	Introduction	77
3.1.2.	Which Manifestations are to be Protected?	77
3.1.3.	Limitations	80
3.1.3.1.	General aspects	80
3.1.3.2.	The Expression 'Prescribed by Law/Determined by Law'	85
3.1.3.3.	The Expression 'Meeting the Just Requirements of ... in a Democratic Society'	87
3.1.3.4.	The Expression 'Rights and Freedoms of Others'	90
3.1.3.5.	The Expression 'Morality, Public Order and the General Welfare'	93
a.	General Welfare	93
b.	Public Health	94
c.	Public Safety	95
d.	Morality	97
e.	Public Order	97
3.1.3.6.	Derogation and Limitation	100
3.1.3.7.	Other Limitations	102
3.1.4.	The Freedom to Manifest One's Religion or Belief in Worship	103
3.1.5.	The Freedom to Manifest One's Religion or Belief in Observance	105
3.1.5.1.	Language	106

3.1.5.2.	Pilgrimage	107
3.1.5.3.	Disposal of the Dead	110
3.1.5.4.	Dietary Practices	111
3.1.5.5.	Specific Equipment and Symbols	113
3.1.5.6.	Acts Contrary to the Observance of One's Religion or Belief	116
3.1.6.	The Freedom to Manifest One's Religion or Belief in Practice	121
3.1.6.1.	The Right to Express (Opposite) Opinions in Matters of Religion or Belief	122
3.1.6.2.	The Right to Disseminate One's Religion or Belief through Publications as well as through the Mass Media	123
3.1.6.3.	The General Right to Disseminate One's Religion or Belief and the Right to Endeavour to Persuade Others	125
3.1.7.	Concluding Observations	128
3.2.	States' Practices with Regard to the Freedom to Manifest One's Religion or Belief	129
3.2.1.	Introduction	129
3.2.2.	National Limitation Clauses	130
3.2.3.	Accusations concerning Specific Aspects of the Freedom to Manifest One's Religion or Belief	137
3.2.4.	Controversial Freedoms	147
3.2.4.1.	The Right of Pilgrimage	147
3.2.4.2.	The Right to Refrain from Taking an Oath against the Precepts of One's Religion or Belief	149
3.2.4.3.	The Right to Refuse to Pay Certain Taxes for Conscientious Reasons	151
3.2.4.4.	Female Circumcision	152
3.2.5.	The Right to Disseminate One's Religion or Belief	154
3.2.6.	Concluding Observations	168

Chapter IV

Conscientious Objection to Military Service

4.1.	The Codification of the Right of Conscientious Objection to Military Service	169
4.1.1.	Introduction	169
4.1.2.	Recognition of the Right of Conscientious Objection to Military Service by the Commission on Human Rights	170
4.1.3.	Partial Recognition of the Right of Conscientious Objection to Military Service	173
4.1.4.	Objections against the Right of Conscientious Objection to Military Service	176

Table of Contents

4.1.5.	The Actual Scope of the Right of Conscientious Objection to Military Service	181
4.1.5.1.	General Aspects	181
4.1.5.2.	Limitations of the Right of Conscientious Objection	183
a.	Times of Emergency	185
b.	Shortage of Manpower	186
c.	Military Service as Heroic Act	186
d.	Conscientious Objection as Discrimination?	186
e.	Technical Objections	187
f.	Formal Objections	188
g.	Conscientious Objection no Adequate Solution?	188
h.	Distinction between Haves and Have-Nots?	189
4.1.6.	The Role of Non-Governmental Organizations	189
4.1.7.	Concluding Observations	192
4.2.	The Right of Conscientious Objection to Military Service in Practice	194
4.2.1.	Introduction	194
4.2.2.	The Tendencies as They Appear from the Major Questionnaires	196
4.2.3.	The Proceedings of the Human Rights Committee	200
4.2.4.	Concluding Observations	206

PART TWO:

THE RIGHT TO NON-DISCRIMINATION ON THE BASIS OF RELIGION OR BELIEF	209
---	------------

Chapter V

The Right of Non-Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief

5.1.	The Codification of the Right of Non-Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief	211
5.1.1.	Introduction	211
5.1.2.	The Concept of Discrimination	213
5.1.2.1.	The Grounds for Discrimination	215
5.1.2.2.	The Rights and Freedoms to be Protected from Discrimination	217
5.1.2.3.	The Arbitrary Element	222
5.1.2.4.	Discrimination and Intolerance	226
5.1.3.	Protection against Discriminatory Acts	231
5.1.4.	Concluding Observations	231
5.2.	The Right of Non-Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief in Practice	232
5.2.1.	Introduction	232
5.2.2.	Main Trends	232

5.2.3.	Discrimination with Regard to Which Rights?	235
5.2.4.	Public vs. Private Life	241
5.2.5.	'Religion or Belief' as Grounds for Discrimination	243
5.2.6.	The Arbitrary Element	244
5.2.7.	Concluding Observations	248

PART THREE:

THE COMMUNITY ASPECT OF THE FREEDOM OF THOUGHT, CONSCIENCE AND RELIGION	249
--	------------

Chapter VI

The Freedom to Manifest One's Religion or Belief in Community with Others

6.1.	The Codification of the Freedom to Manifest One's Religion or Belief in Community with Others	251
6.1.1.	Introduction	251
6.1.2.	The Freedom to Manifest One's Religion or Belief in Community with Others	253
6.1.2.1.	The Explicit Recognition of the Community Aspect	253
6.1.2.2.	The Rights of Religious Minorities	254
a.	The Relationship between Articles 18 and 27 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	254
b.	Definition of the Term 'Minority'	258
c.	The Recognition of the Collective Rights of Religious Minorities	260
d.	immigrant minorities	268
6.1.3.	Detailed Aspects of the Freedom to Manifest One's Religion or Belief in Community with Others	269
6.1.3.1.	The Observance of Holidays	270
6.1.3.2.	Processions	272
6.1.3.3.	The Right to Communicate with Others in Matters of Religion or Belief	274
6.1.3.4.	The Right to Establish Institutions Based on Religion or Belief	277
6.1.4.	The Relation of Church and State at the National Level	283
6.1.4.1.	General Considerations	283
6.1.4.2.	Practical Links between Church and State	287
a.	Registration	288
b.	Subsidies	289
c.	Taxation	293
d.	Religion or Belief as Requirement for Official Posts	294

Table of Contents

e.	Protection against Interference with the Freedom to Manifest One's Religion or Belief by Outsiders	296
6.1.5.	The Relation of Church and State at the International Level	296
6.1.5.1.	International Law and Religion or Belief	297
6.1.5.2.	International Law and Religious Law	300
6.1.6.	Concluding Observations	304
6.2.	The Freedom to Manifest One's Religion or Belief in Community with Others in Practice	305
6.2.1.	Introduction	305
6.2.2.	The Position of Religious Minorities	305
6.2.3.	Detailed Aspects of the Freedom to Manifest One's Religion or Belief in Community with Others	316
6.2.3.1.	The Observance of Holidays	316
6.2.3.2.	The Right to Communicate with Others in Matters of Religion or Belief	318
6.2.3.3.	The Right to Establish Institutions Based on Religion or Belief	320
6.2.4.	The Relation of Church and State at the National Level/General Aspects	328
6.2.4.1.	Organizations Based on Religion or Belief Perceived as a Potential Threat to the State	328
6.2.4.2.	Established Churches	331
a.	States Founded on the Basis of a Particular Religion or Belief	331
b.	Official Religions or Beliefs	336
6.2.5.	Practical Links between Church and State	342
6.2.5.1.	Registration	342
6.2.5.2.	Subsidies	343
6.2.5.3.	Taxation	345
6.2.5.4.	Religion or Belief as Requirement for Official Posts	346
6.2.6.	Religious Law	349
6.2.7.	Concluding Observations	357

Chapter VII

The Right of Protection for Places of Worship or Assembly in Connection with a Religion or Belief

7.1.	The Codification of the Right of Protection for Places of Worship or Assembly in Connection with a Religion or Belief	359
7.1.1.	Introduction	359
7.1.2.	The Right to Establish and to Maintain Places of Worship and Assembly	359
7.1.3.	The Right of Access to Places of Worship and Assembly	361

7.1.4.	The Right to Protection of Places of Worship and Assembly	363
7.1.5.	Concluding Observations	368
7.2.	The Right to Protection for Places of Worship or Assembly in Connection with a Religion or Belief in Practice	369
7.2.1.	Introduction	369
7.2.2.	The Protection of the Holy Places in the Middle East	369
7.2.3.	The Right to Establish or to Maintain Places of Worship or Assembly	381
7.2.3.1.	The Right to Establish Places of Worship or Assembly	381
7.2.3.2.	The Right to Maintain Places of Worship or Assembly	383
7.2.4.	The Right of Access	387
7.2.4.1.	Access to the Holy Sites of Indigenous Peoples	388
7.2.4.2.	Persons Coming from Abroad	389
7.2.4.3.	Places of Interest to More than One Religion or Belief	390
7.2.5.	The Right of Protection against State or Outside Interference	392
7.2.5.1.	Protection against State Interference	392
	a. Destruction of Places of Worship or Assembly	393
	b. Confiscation Measures	396
	c. More Limited Forms of State Interference	400
	d. Acts of Sacrilege	401
	e. Protection in Times of Armed Conflict	404
7.2.5.2.	Protection against Outside Interference	407
7.2.5.3.	Material or Financial Assistance for Places of Worship or Assembly	419
7.2.6.	Concluding Observations	421

Chapter VIII

The Rights of Institutions Based on Religion or Belief

8.1.	The Codification of the Rights of Institutions Based on Religion or Belief	423
8.1.1.	Introduction	423
8.1.2.	The Internal Activities of Institutions Based on Religion or Belief	423
8.1.2.1.	The Right to Appoint Religious Personnel	425
8.1.2.2.	The Right to the Training of Religious Personnel	429
8.1.2.3.	Other Internal Activities	433
8.1.3.	External activities	433
8.1.4.	The Right to Raise Voluntary Contributions	440
8.1.5.	Concluding Observations	442
8.2.	The Rights of Institutions Based on Religion or Belief in Practice	442

Table of Contents

8.2.1.	Introduction	442
8.2.2.	Internal Activities	442
8.2.2.1.	Appointment of Religious Personnel	449
8.2.2.2.	The Right to the Training of Religious Personnel	449
8.2.2.3.	Persecution of Religious Leaders	451
8.2.2.4.	The Right to Communicate for Religious Personnel	452
8.2.3.	Charitable and Humanitarian Activities	456
8.2.4.	'Political' Activities	461
8.2.4.1.	Acts of Reconciliation	462
8.2.4.2.	Activities Aimed at the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms	463
a.	The Role of the Catholic Church in Latin America	464
b.	The Role of the Churches in Southern Africa	469
c.	Human Rights Related Activities in Support of the National Government's Policies	473
d.	Other Human Rights Related Activities	475
8.2.4.3.	Other Political Activities	479
8.2.5.	Concluding Observations	485
8.3.	The Role of Organizations Based on Religion or Belief at UN-Level	486
8.3.1.	Introduction	486
8.3.2.	Organizations Based on Religion or Belief as Source of Information for UN-Reports on Human Rights	488
8.3.3.	The Use of Information from Organizations Based on Religion or Belief during the Debates on States' Practices	490
8.3.4.	Direct Appeals to Organizations Based on Religion or Belief to Engage in Human Rights Related Activities	492
8.3.4.1.	The Role of Organizations Based on Religion or Belief in Fighting <i>Apartheid</i>	493
8.3.4.2.	Other Appeals	496
8.3.5.	Concluding Observations	499
 Chapter IX		
Religion or Belief and Family Law		
9.1.	The Influence of Religion or Belief on the Codification of Family Law	501
9.1.1.	Introduction	501
9.1.2.	The Right to Enter into Marriage	503
9.1.2.1.	Formal Recognition of Religious Marriages	503
9.1.2.2.	The Consent of Both Parties to the Marriage and the Minimum Age Requirement	510

9.1.2.3.	Equality of Rights for Men and Women	513
9.1.2.4.	No Limitation Due to Race, Nationality or Religion	516
9.1.2.5.	Official Registration	519
9.1.3.	The Dissolution of Marriage	520
9.1.4.	The Right to Celebrate Marriage in Accordance with Rites Based on Religion or Belief	524
9.1.5.	Challenges	527
9.1.5.1.	The Influence of Religion on the Position of Islamic States	527
9.1.5.2.	Indigenous Peoples	530
9.1.6.	Concluding Observations	531
9.2.	States' Practices with regard to Religion or Belief and Family Law	532
9.2.1.	Introduction	532
9.2.2.	Equal Treatment of Religions or Beliefs	533
9.2.3.	Equal Rights for Men and Women	536
9.2.4.	No Limitation of Marriage Due to Religion	539
9.2.5.	Official Registration	541
9.2.6.	Concluding Observations	542

Chapter X

The Right to Education in Accordance with One's Religion or Belief

10.1.	The Codification of the Right to Education in Accordance with One's Religion or Belief	545
10.1.1.	Introduction	545
10.1.2.	The Role of Private and Public Educational Institutions	546
10.1.2.1.	The Right to Establish Private Educational Institutions Based on Religion or Belief	547
	a. Main International Instruments	547
	b. Other Relevant Codification Exercises	553
10.1.2.2.	Active State Support for Private Educational Institutions	556
10.1.2.3.	Segregation	557
10.1.2.4.	The Right to Religious Education in Public Educational Institutions	559
10.1.3.	The Right of the Parents or Legal Guardians to Choose Forms of Education in Accordance with a Religion or Belief	563
10.1.3.1.	The Right of Parents or Legal Guardians to Choose for Their Children Private Educational Institutions	565
10.1.3.2.	The Right of Parents or Legal Guardians to Have Their Children Educated in Matters Relating to Their Religion or Belief	566

Table of Contents

10.1.3.3.	The Right of Parents or Legal Guardians to Organize Life within the Family in Accordance with Their Religion or Belief	569
10.1.4.	The Right of the Child to Education in Accordance with His or Her Religion or Belief	571
10.1.4.1.	The General Limitation of the Rights of Parents or Legal Guardians	571
10.1.4.2.	The Right of the Child vis-à-vis His or Her Parents	575
a.	The Universal Declaration of Human Rights	575
b.	The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	577
c.	The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	579
d.	The Convention against Discrimination in Education	580
e.	The Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of Intolerance and of Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief	581
f.	The Convention on the Rights of the Child	583
10.1.4.3.	The Right of the Child vis-à-vis His or Her Legal Guardians	584
10.1.5.	Concluding Observations	586
10.2.	The Right to Education in Accordance with One's Religion or Belief in Practice	587
10.2.1.	Introduction	587
10.2.2.	The Right to Establish Private Educational Institutions Based on Religion or Belief	588
10.2.3.	State Support for Private Educational Institutions	594
10.2.4.	Segregation	597
10.2.5.	Religious education in public educational institutions	599
10.2.6.	The Rights of Parents, Legal Guardians and Children	603
10.2.7.	Concluding Observations	605
PART FOUR:		
THE PROMOTION OF TOLERANCE		607
Chapter XI		
The Promotion of Tolerance in Matters Relating to Religion or Belief		
11.1.	The Codification of the Ways to Promote Tolerance in Matters Relating to Religion or Belief	609
11.1.1.	Introduction	609
11.1.2.	Educational Measures	610
11.1.2.1.	Basic Principles	610

11.1.2.2. Early Initiatives Taken by the Sub-Commission	612
11.1.2.3. The Sudden Outbursts of Anti-Semitism in 1960 and 1961	614
11.1.2.4. The Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of Intolerance and of Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief and the Convention on the Rights of the Child	617
11.1.2.5. Follow-up Activities	620
11.1.3. Regulative Measures	628
11.1.3.1. The Prohibition of 'Incitement to Discrimination'	629
11.1.3.2. The Prohibition of Advocacy of Religious Hatred	633
11.1.3.3. The Elimination of All Forms of Intolerance Based on Religion or Belief	643
11.1.3.4. The Prohibition of Abuse of Religion or Belief for Political Purposes	646
11.1.4. Conflicts between Religions or Beliefs	650
11.1.5. Concluding Observations	653
11.2. The Promotion of Tolerance in Matters Relating to Religion or Belief in Practice	655
11.2.1. Introduction	655
11.2.2. Conflicts between Religions or Beliefs within one State	655
11.2.3. Conflicts between States with Religious Connotations	664
11.2.4. The Interpretation of 'Religious Hatred'	671
11.2.5. The Abuse of Religions or Beliefs by States to Legitimize Human Rights Violations	680
11.2.6. Concluding Observations	688
 PART FIVE:	
REGIONAL EUROPEAN INSTRUMENTS	689
 Chapter XII	
The Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion in the Framework of Regional European Instruments	
12.1. The Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion in the Framework of the European Convention on Human Rights	691
12.1.1. Introduction	691
12.1.2. The Freedom to Have or to Adopt a Religion or Belief of One's Choice	692
12.1.3. The Limitation Grounds concerning the Freedom to Manifest One's Religion or Belief	694
12.1.4. The Individual Aspects of the Freedom to Manifest One's Religion or Belief	698

Table of Contents

12.1.5.	The Right of Non-Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief	703
12.1.6.	The Community Aspects of the Freedom to Manifest One's Religion or Belief	705
12.1.6.1.	Church-State Relations	705
12.1.6.2.	The Right to Establish and Maintain Places of Worship or Assembly in connection with a Religion or Belief	706
12.1.6.3.	Rights of Institutions Based on Religion or Belief	707
12.1.6.4.	Religion or Belief and Family Law	708
12.1.6.5.	The Right to Education in Accordance with One's Religion or Belief	710
12.1.7.	Concluding Observations	713
12.2.	The Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion in the Context of the Helsinki Process	714
12.2.1.	The Nature of the Helsinki Process	714
12.2.2.	The Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion in the OSCE-Instruments: General Aspects	715
12.2.3.	The Individual Aspects of the Freedom to Manifest One's Religion or Belief	719
12.2.4.	The Community Aspects of the Freedom to Manifest One's Religion or Belief	721
12.2.5.	Concluding Observations	727
PART SIX:		
CONCLUSIONS		729
Chapter XIII		
Conclusions		
13.1.	Is there a Need for a New International Instrument?	731
13.2.	The Relevance of the Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion	737
13.3.	The Relation of Church and State	739
13.4.	The Dynamic Nature of the Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion	742
Samenvatting in het Nederlands		745
Annex I: List of consulted literature		749
Annex 2: Relevant provisions of international instruments		759
Curriculum Vitae		777