

Contents

| | |
|---|----------|
| <i>Acknowledgements</i> | vii |
| <i>Tables of Cases</i> | xxxv |
| I. Judgments and Decisions of the European Court of Human Rights | xxxv |
| II. Decisions of the European Commission of Human Rights—Alphabetical | lxxiv |
| III. Decisions of the European Commission of Human Rights—Numerical | lxxxviii |
| IV. Article 31 Reports of the European Commission on Human Rights—Alphabetical | xcix |
| V. Decisions and Views of the Human Rights Committee under Article 28 of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) | cii |
| VI. Judgments of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights | cv |
| VII. Decisions of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights | cvi |
| <i>List of Abbreviations</i> | cvii |

Part One—Introduction

Chapter 1. About this Book

| | |
|---|---|
| I. The Subject | 3 |
| A. Definitions | 3 |
| 1. 'Human Rights' | 3 |
| 2. Criminal Proceedings | 5 |
| 3. Limitations, Exclusions | 5 |
| (a) The Procedures for the Implementation of Human Rights | 5 |
| (b) The International Criminal Court(s) | 6 |
| (c) Criminal Proceedings against Children and Juveniles | 6 |
| (d) Domestic Case-law | 6 |
| B. The Importance of the Subject | 6 |
| II. The Perspectives | 8 |
| A. The Geographical Perspective | 9 |
| B. The Legal Perspective | 9 |

| | |
|---|----|
| C. The 'Political' Perspective | 10 |
| D. The 'Scientific' Perspective | 11 |
| III. The Structure of the Book | 12 |
| Chapter 2. The Scope of Application of the Right to a Fair Trial in Criminal Matters | |
| I. Introduction | 13 |
| A. The Texts | 13 |
| B. Three Aspects Concerning the Scope of the Provision | 13 |
| II. The Notion of 'Criminal' | 14 |
| A. General Observations | 14 |
| B. The Autonomous Notion of the Term 'Criminal Charge' | 14 |
| C. The Three Criteria First Established in <i>Engel</i> | 16 |
| D. The Substance of the Three Criteria | 18 |
| 1. The Classification of the Offence under National Law | 18 |
| 2. The Nature of the Offence | 19 |
| (a) Not to be Confused with the Nature of Proceedings | 19 |
| (b) General Considerations | 19 |
| (c) The Nature of Disciplinary Charges | 20 |
| (d) Offences of a 'Mixed Character' | 21 |
| 3. The Nature and Degree of Severity of the Sanction Incurred | 22 |
| (a) Deprivation of Liberty | 22 |
| (b) Pecuniary Sanctions | 23 |
| (c) Other Sanctions | 25 |
| (d) Actual, Probable, or Possible Severity of the Sanction? | 26 |
| 4. The Scope of the Sanction | 26 |
| 5. The Relationship Between the Different Criteria | 27 |
| E. Disciplinary Matters as 'Civil Rights and Obligations' | 28 |
| F. Critical Appraisal of the Case-law of the Court | 29 |
| III. The Notion of 'Charge' | 31 |
| A. General Observations | 31 |
| B. The Term 'Charge' as an Autonomous Notion | 32 |
| C. Procedural Steps to which Article 6 Applies | 32 |
| D. Procedural Steps to which Article 6 Does Not Apply | 33 |
| 1. Habeus Corpus Proceedings | 33 |
| 2. Confiscation Orders | 34 |
| 3. Immediate Confiscation of a Driving Licence | 35 |
| 4. Proceedings in Relation to a Retrial | 36 |
| 5. Extradition Proceedings | 36 |
| 6. Proceedings for Challenging the Impartiality of a Judge | 36 |
| IV. Rights of the Victim | 36 |

| | |
|---|----|
| A. The Starting Point | 36 |
| B. Inconsistencies | 37 |
| C. The Case-law Prior to <i>Perez v. France</i> | 38 |
| D. The Judgment in <i>Perez v. France</i> | 40 |
| E. A Critical Appraisal | 41 |

Part Two—The General Fair Trial Guarantees

Chapter 3. The Right to an Independent and Impartial Tribunal

| | |
|--|----|
| I. Introduction | 45 |
| A. The Texts | 45 |
| B. The Origins of the Guarantee | 45 |
| C. The Importance of the Right to an Independent and Impartial Tribunal | 46 |
| D. The Definition of 'Tribunal' | 47 |
| E. The References to a Judge, a Tribunal, or a Court in the Convention | 48 |
| F. The Relationship Between the Requirements of 'Independence', 'Impartiality', and 'Established by Law' | 49 |
| II. A Tribunal Established by Law | 50 |
| III. Independence | 53 |
| A. The Manner of Appointment | 54 |
| B. The Term of Office | 55 |
| C. Safeguards Against Outside Pressure | 55 |
| D. The Appearance of Independence | 56 |
| E. Additional Aspects of Independence | 57 |
| 1. The Authority of the Judgment | 57 |
| 2. The Autonomy of the Tribunal | 58 |
| 3. Civil Servants as Members of a Tribunal | 59 |
| 4. Military Judges Sitting in an Ordinary Court | 60 |
| IV. Impartiality | 61 |
| A. Definition | 61 |
| B. The Objective and the Subjective Approach | 61 |
| C. Lack of Impartiality Because of Personal Bias | 63 |
| D. Lack of Impartiality Under the Objective Test | 66 |
| 1. Lack of Impartiality Due to Prior Involvement of the Judge in the Same Case | 66 |
| (a) As a Prosecutor | 66 |
| (b) As a Member of the Police | 68 |
| (c) As an Investigator | 69 |

| | |
|---|----|
| (d) As Member of a Body Responsible for Preparing the Indictment | 72 |
| (e) Having Taken One or More Decisions Regarding the Defendant's Detention | 74 |
| (f) As a Judge on the Merits | 75 |
| (g) As a Member of the <i>Conseil d'Etat</i> which had Given an Opinion on the Regulations at Issue | 76 |
| (h) In a Combination of Multiple Functions | 77 |
| (i) Conclusion | 78 |
| 2. Lack of Impartiality Due to an Affiliation to One of the Parties | 78 |
| 3. Procedural Issues | 79 |
| V. Conclusion | 80 |
| | |
| Chapter 4. The General Right to a Fair Trial | |
| I. Introduction | 81 |
| A. The Texts | 81 |
| B. The Origins | 81 |
| C. Importance and Purpose | 82 |
| D. The Scope of the Right to a Fair Trial | 84 |
| E. The Relationship Between the General Rule and the Specific Rights: Evaluation of the Proceedings ' <i>As a Whole</i> ' | 86 |
| II. The Right to Adversarial Proceedings | 89 |
| A. The Principle and its Meaning | 89 |
| B. The Definition | 90 |
| C. The Characteristics of the Guarantee | 90 |
| D. The Case-law | 91 |
| 1. Submissions of the Procurator General to Supreme Jurisdictions | 91 |
| 2. The Duty to Disclose Evidence | 92 |
| (a) Material Withheld by the Prosecuting Authority | 92 |
| (b) Duty of the Court to Disclose | 94 |
| III. The Principle of Equality of Arms | 94 |
| A. The Principle | 94 |
| B. The Definition | 96 |
| C. Aspects of Equality | 97 |
| 1. The Relativity of Equality | 97 |
| 2. The Importance of the Presence of the Prosecution at the Hearing | 98 |
| 3. The Abstract Value of Equality | 98 |
| D. The Case-law | 99 |
| 1. The Presence of a Prosecutor at the Deliberations of the Court | 99 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 2. Privileged Information for the Prosecution | 100 |
| (a) Failure to Inform the Appellant of the Date of the Hearing before the French <i>cour de cassation</i> | 101 |
| (b) Communication of the <i>Rapporteur's</i> Draft to the Prosecution, but Not to the Defence | 102 |
| IV. The Right to a Reasoned Judgment | 102 |
| A. The Meaning and Function of the Right to a Reasoned Judgment | 102 |
| 1. Reasons of a Functional Orientation | 103 |
| 2. Reasons of Legal Theory | 103 |
| 3. Reasons of Acceptability | 104 |
| 4. Reasons of Transparency | 104 |
| 5. The Right to a Reasoned Decision as an Aspect of the Right to be Heard | 104 |
| B. The Standards of the Reasoning | 106 |
| C. Limits to the Requirement that Reasons be Given | 107 |
| 1. The Jury Trial | 107 |
| 2. Appeal Judgments | 108 |
| D. The Case-law | 108 |
| V. Other Aspects of Fairness | 110 |
| A. <i>Nullum Judicium Sine Lege</i> | 110 |
| B. Entrapment | 111 |
| C. Compulsion to Accept a 'Settlement' | 113 |
| D. Interference by a Non-judicial Authority | 114 |
| E. Miscellaneous Elements of Unfairness | 114 |
| 1. Legal Certainty | 114 |
| 2. Respect for Judgments | 115 |
| 3. <i>Pro Memoria</i> | 116 |
| | |
| Chapter 5. The Right to a Public Hearing | |
| I. Introduction | 117 |
| A. The Texts | 117 |
| B. The Origins of the Guarantee | 119 |
| C. The Purpose of the Guarantee of a Public Trial | 119 |
| 1. The Case-law | 119 |
| 2. Weakness of the Court's View | 121 |
| 3. Individual Right or Institutional Guarantee? | 121 |
| 4. The Obligation to Pronounce the Judgment Publicly | 124 |
| D. The Possibility of Waiving the Right to a Public Trial | 124 |
| E. A Right to a Closed Hearing? | 125 |
| II. The Substance of the Right to a Public Hearing | 126 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| B. The Role of the Media | 126 |
| C. The Substance of the Public Hearing | 128 |
| III. Limitations and Exceptions | 129 |
| A. Implied Limitations? | 129 |
| B. The Limitations Set Out in the Text | 130 |
| C. Appeal Proceedings | 131 |
| D. Cases Where Violations Were Found | 131 |
| IV. 'Judgment Shall be Pronounced Publicly' | 131 |

Chapter 6. The Right to be Tried Within a Reasonable Time

| | |
|---|-----|
| I. Introduction | 134 |
| A. The Texts | 134 |
| B. The Origins of the Guarantee | 135 |
| C. The Purpose of the Guarantee | 135 |
| D. Length of Proceedings and Length of Detention on Remand | 136 |
| E. The Points to be Discussed | 137 |
| II. The Beginning of the Relevant Period | 137 |
| A. The 'Autonomous' Interpretation of the Term 'Charged' | 137 |
| B. The General Rule | 138 |
| C. Proceedings Commenced Before the Entry into Force of the Convention | 140 |
| III. The End of the Relevant Period | 140 |
| IV. The Assessment of the Period | 141 |
| A. The General Rule | 141 |
| B. The Conduct of the Applicant (and/or Counsel) | 142 |
| C. The Importance of the Proceedings for the Accused | 144 |
| D. The Complexity of the Case | 144 |
| E. The Conduct of the Domestic Authorities | 146 |
| 1. The Principle | 146 |
| 2. Ineffective Justifications | 147 |
| 3. Effective Justifications | 148 |
| V. Compensation for the Excessive Length of Proceedings | 148 |

Part Three—The Specific Rights of the Defence

Chapter 7. The Right to be Presumed Innocent

| | |
|---------------------------------|-----|
| I. Introduction | 153 |
| A. The Texts | 153 |
| B. The Origins of the Guarantee | 153 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| C. General Characteristics of the Guarantee and some Basic Definitions | 154 |
| 1. 'Charged with a Criminal Offence' | 155 |
| 2. 'Presumed' | 156 |
| 3. 'Innocent' | 156 |
| (a) <i>Nullum Crimen Sine Culpa?</i> The Issue of <i>Mens Rea</i> | 157 |
| (b) 'Innocent' or 'Not Liable to be Punished'? | 159 |
| 4. 'Proved' Guilty | 161 |
| 5. Proved Guilty 'According to Law' | 162 |
| D. The Two Distinct Aspects of the Presumption of Innocence | 163 |
| E. The Relationship Between the Presumption of Innocence and Other Aspects of the Right to a Fair Trial | 164 |
| 1. The Presumption of Innocence and the Impartiality of the Judge | 164 |
| 2. The Presumption of Innocence and the Right to a Fair Trial | 165 |
| 3. The Presumption of Innocence and the Right to be Informed of the Charge | 165 |
| 4. The Presumption of Innocence and the Privilege against Self-incrimination | 166 |
| 5. The Presumption of Innocence in Civil Proceedings | 166 |
| F. The Specific Problems Arising with the Guarantee | 166 |
| II. The 'Outcome-related' Aspects of the Guarantee | 167 |
| A. The Burden of Proof | 167 |
| 1. The Burden of Proof in the Proceedings | 167 |
| 2. Reversal of the Burden of Proof by Legislation | 168 |
| (a) Legal Presumptions to the Detriment of the Accused | 168 |
| (i) <i>Salabiaku</i> and Similar Judgments | 168 |
| (ii) Assessment | 170 |
| (b) Criminal Liability for the Conduct of Others (Vicarious Liability) | 171 |
| (c) Prosecution of Legal Persons | 171 |
| 3. Problems Related to Sentencing | 172 |
| 4. The Revocation of a Suspended Sentence | 173 |
| B. The Evaluation of the Evidence | 174 |
| 1. General Observations: The 'Fourth-instance' Issue | 174 |
| 2. The Issue of Bias | 174 |
| (a) Judicial Bias | 174 |
| (b) Bias of Other Participants in the Proceedings | 175 |
| (i) The Prosecuting Authority | 175 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| (ii) The Expert | 175 |
| (c) The Media | 177 |
| 3. No Right of Access to Court in Order to Establish One's Innocence | 178 |
| III. The 'Reputation-related' Aspects of the Guarantee | 178 |
| A. Introduction | 178 |
| B. Statements During the Pre-trial Phase of the Proceedings | 178 |
| C. Measures of Coercion, in Particular Detention on Remand | 179 |
| 1. The Principle | 179 |
| 2. The Limits | 180 |
| (a) General Aspects | 180 |
| (b) The Nature of Detention on Remand | 181 |
| D. Violation of the Presumption of Innocence in Cases where the Proceedings have Ended in Some Way Other than by Conviction and Sentence | 182 |
| 1. The Effect of an Acquittal on the Presumption of Innocence | 182 |
| 2. The Effect of a Procedural Termination of Criminal Proceedings on the Presumption of Innocence | 185 |
| (a) Order to Pay Costs and Compensation to the Plaintiff | 186 |
| (b) The Refusal of Compensation | 187 |
| (c) The Affirmation of Continuing Suspicion | 188 |
| 3. Statements Unrelated to Criminal Proceedings | 188 |
| E. Assessment | 189 |
| | |
| Chapter 8. The Right to be Informed of the Accusation | |
| I. Introduction | 192 |
| A. The Texts | 192 |
| B. The Origins of the Guarantee | 192 |
| C. The Purpose of the Guarantee | 193 |
| 1. The Functional Approach | 193 |
| 2. The Absolutist Approach | 193 |
| 3. The Case-law | 194 |
| 4. Assessment | 194 |
| D. Two Aspects of the Guarantee | 195 |
| E. The Structure of the Guarantee | 195 |
| II. Elements of Substance | 196 |
| A. The Term 'Charge'/'Accusation' | 196 |
| 1. The Case-law | 196 |
| 2. The Opinions of Legal Scholars | 198 |
| 3. Assessment | 199 |
| B. 'Nature and Cause' and 'Detail' | 200 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| 1. With Regard to the Facts | 201 |
| 2. With Regard to the Law | 201 |
| C. A Right 'To Be Informed' | 203 |
| III. Elements of Form | 205 |
| A. Must the Information be Given in Writing? | 205 |
| B. The Language | 206 |
| C. 'Promptly' | 206 |
| | |
| Chapter 9. Adequate Time and Facilities | |
| I. Introduction | 208 |
| A. The Texts | 208 |
| B. The Origins of the Guarantee | 208 |
| C. The Purpose and Importance of the Guarantee | 209 |
| D. The Relative Character of the Guarantee | 211 |
| 1. The General Relativity | 211 |
| 2. The Specific Relativity | 213 |
| 3. The Diligence Required from the Defence | 214 |
| II. The Right to Adequate Time | 215 |
| A. The Purpose of the Guarantee | 215 |
| B. The Relation of the Guarantee to the Other Rights of the Defence | 216 |
| 1. The Relationship of Article 6 § 1, the Right to Trial 'Within a Reasonable Time' | 216 |
| 2. The Relationship to the Principle of 'Equality of Arms' | 216 |
| 3. The Relationship to Article 6 § 3(a) | 217 |
| 4. The Relationship to Article 6 § 3(c) | 218 |
| C. What Constitutes 'Adequate Time'? | 218 |
| 1. The Relevant Period | 218 |
| 2. The Assessment of What is 'Adequate' | 220 |
| 3. Proposals | 221 |
| 4. Accelerated Proceedings | 221 |
| III. The Right to Adequate Facilities | 222 |
| A. Access to the File | 222 |
| 1. General Observations | 222 |
| 2. Four Aspects of Access to the File | 223 |
| (a) Access to the File Under the Continental System | 224 |
| (b) Discovery Under the Common-law System | 224 |
| (c) Discovery of 'Hidden Material' | 225 |
| (d) Investigation by the Defence | 227 |
| 3. The Modalities of Discovery and Access to the File | 228 |
| (a) The Object | 228 |
| (b) Who has Access to the File? | 230 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| (c) When does the Right of Access Arise? | 231 |
| (d) Various Issues | 235 |
| B. Other Facilities | 236 |
| 1. Access to Legal Materials | 236 |
| 2. A Reasoned Judgment | 236 |
| 3. Notification of Consular Rights | 237 |
| 4. Access to Medical Examination | 237 |
| 5. The Right to a Hearing | 238 |
| C. Exceptions | 238 |
| | |
| Chapter 10. The Right to Defend Oneself and to Have the Assistance of Counsel | |
| I. Introduction | 242 |
| A. The Texts | 242 |
| B. The Origins of the Guarantee | 243 |
| C. The Structure of Article 6 § 3(c) of the ECHR | 243 |
| 1. The Purpose of the Right to a Defence | 244 |
| (a) The Technical Aspect | 245 |
| (b) The Psychological Aspect | 245 |
| (c) The Humanitarian Aspect | 246 |
| (d) The Structural Aspect of the Right to a Defence | 247 |
| 2. The Absolute Character of the Right to a Defence | 247 |
| (a) A Right without Any Restrictions? | 247 |
| (b) No Derogation in Times of War? | 248 |
| (c) Is a Violation Possible in the Absence of Prejudice? | 248 |
| (d) Is a Violation Possible if the Accused was Finally Acquitted? | 248 |
| 3. The Scope of the Application of the Right to a Defence | 249 |
| (a) The Right to Legal Assistance Outside Criminal Proceedings | 249 |
| (i) The Right to Legal Assistance in Proceedings on 'Civil Rights and Obligations' | 249 |
| (ii) The Right to Legal Assistance in Habeas Corpus Proceedings | 249 |
| (b) The Right to Legal Assistance During Different Phases of the Proceedings | 250 |
| (i) Before the Trial | 250 |
| (ii) Proceedings on Appeal | 251 |
| II. The Right to Defend Oneself | 251 |
| A. The Right of the Accused to Act in His or Her Defence | 251 |
| 1. The General Rule | 251 |
| 2. The Right to be Present at the Hearing | 252 |
| (a) The General Principle | 252 |
| (b) Exceptions for Disciplinary Reasons | 253 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| (c) Trial <i>In Absentia</i> | 253 |
| (i) Possibility of a Retrial | 254 |
| (ii) Conditions for a Trial <i>In Absentia</i> Without the Possibility of a Retrial | 255 |
| (iii) Waiver and its Limitations | 255 |
| (d) The Right to be Present at a Hearing on Appeal | 257 |
| (i) Whether there was a Full Hearing at First Instance | 257 |
| (ii) Whether there is a Full Re-examination of the Case | 257 |
| (iii) What was at Stake for the Applicant | 258 |
| (iv) Whether there was a Risk of <i>Reformatio in Peius</i> | 258 |
| (v) Whether the Prosecutor Attended the Hearing | 258 |
| (vi) Whether the Appeal is Limited to Questions of Law | 258 |
| (vii) Whether the Accused was Given a New Sentence | 259 |
| (viii) Leave-to-Appeal Proceedings | 260 |
| (ix) The Obligation on the Defence to Act Diligently | 260 |
| 3. The Limitation to Lawful Defence Activities | 261 |
| 4. Formalities Must be Respected | 262 |
| B. The Right of the Accused to 'Defend Himself in Person' | 263 |
| III. The Right to the Assistance of Counsel of One's Own Choosing | 266 |
| A. A 'Practically Absolute' Right | 266 |
| B. Limitations as to the Persons Eligible as Counsel | 267 |
| C. Limitations as to the Number of Counsel | 268 |
| D. Confiscation of Assets and the Right to Counsel of the Accused's Choosing | 269 |
| IV. The Right to Legal Aid | 270 |
| A. The Economic Prerequisite | 271 |
| B. The Interests of Justice | 272 |
| 1. The Seriousness of the Offence and the Severity of the Punishment | 273 |
| 2. The Complexity of the Case | 275 |
| 3. The Particularities of the Proceeding | 275 |
| 4. The Particularities of the Accused | 276 |
| C. The Choice of the Lawyer | 276 |
| D. 'Free' | 277 |
| V. The Right to Contact with Counsel | 278 |
| A. The Principle | 278 |
| B. Exceptions | 281 |
| C. The Right to Contact with Counsel During the Police Investigations | 282 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| VI. The Right to the Effective Assistance of Counsel | 286 |
| A. The Quality of the Defence | 286 |
| B. Effective Assistance During Pre-trial Proceedings | 288 |
| Chapter 11. The Right to Test Witness Evidence | |
| I. Introduction | 291 |
| A. The Texts | 291 |
| B. The Origins of the Guarantee | 292 |
| C. The Purpose of the Guarantee | 292 |
| D. The Character of the Guarantee | 293 |
| 1. The Proximity to the Establishment of the Facts | 293 |
| 2. The Relative Character of the Guarantee | 294 |
| (a) The Issue <i>In Abstracto</i> | 294 |
| (b) The Court's Jurisprudence | 295 |
| (c) The Relevance of the Statement as Evidence | 296 |
| (d) Assessment | 297 |
| (e) The Possibility of Waiver: Requirements of Diligence | 298 |
| E. The Model of Full Compliance with the Guarantee | 299 |
| F. The Problems Arising with the Guarantee | 300 |
| II. Defining the Term 'Witness' | 300 |
| A. The Autonomous Notion of 'Witness' | 301 |
| B. The Classical Notion of Witness | 302 |
| C. Parties as Witnesses | 302 |
| D. Informants as Witnesses | 302 |
| E. Expert Witnesses | 303 |
| F. Application of Article 6 § 3(d) to Evidence Other than that of Witnesses | 304 |
| III. The Right to Question Witnesses at Different Stages of the Proceedings | 305 |
| A. At the Trial | 305 |
| B. During Pre-trial Proceedings | 306 |
| 1. The Witness is Only Questioned During the Investigation | 307 |
| 2. The Right to Question a Witness During Pre-trial Proceedings | 308 |
| C. In Appeal Proceedings | 309 |
| IV. The Exercise of the Right | 309 |
| A. Who is Entitled to Exercise the Right to Question Witnesses? | 309 |
| 1. Counsel and the Accused | 309 |
| 2. The Accused Alone | 310 |
| 3. Counsel Alone | 310 |
| B. How is the Right to be Exercised? | 311 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| V. Limitations of the Right to Test Witness Evidence | 312 |
| A. General Observations | 312 |
| B. Typical Situations Justifying Exceptions | 314 |
| 1. Absent Witnesses | 314 |
| 2. The 'Precious' Witness | 315 |
| 3. The Intimidated Witness | 316 |
| (a) The Justification for Anonymity | 317 |
| (b) The Methods for Counterbalancing Anonymity | 318 |
| 4. The Vulnerable Witness | 320 |
| C. Hearsay Evidence | 322 |
| VI. The Right to Call Witnesses | 322 |
| A. The Particularities of this Right | 323 |
| B. The Discretion of the Presiding Judge | 324 |
| C. The Reluctance of the Strasbourg Court | 324 |
| D. The Further Development of the Case-law | 325 |
| VII. The Equality-of-arms Aspect | 326 |
| | |
| Chapter 12. The Right to the Free Assistance of an Interpreter | |
| I. Introduction | 327 |
| A. The Texts | 327 |
| B. The Origins of the Guarantee | 327 |
| C. The Purpose of Article 6 § 3(e) | 328 |
| 1. The Character and Purpose of the Right to an Interpreter | 328 |
| 2. The Meaning and Purpose of the Right to the Free Assistance of an Interpreter | 330 |
| D. The 'Relative' and the 'Absolute' Character of the Guarantee | 331 |
| E. The Relationship of Article 6 § 3(e) to other Rights of the Defence | 332 |
| 1. The Relationship to Article 5 § 2 and Article 6 § 3(a) | 332 |
| 2. The Relationship to Article 6 § 3(c) | 332 |
| 3. The Relationship to Article 6 § 3(d) | 333 |
| II. The Need for Interpretation | 334 |
| A. The Lack of Linguistic Proficiency | 334 |
| B. The Lack of Acoustic Abilities | 335 |
| III. The Modalities of the Right to an Interpreter | 336 |
| A. The Application at Various Stages of the Proceedings | 336 |
| B. The Application <i>Ratione Materiae</i> : The Objects of Interpretation and Translation | 336 |
| 1. Interpretation at the Trial | 336 |
| 2. Interpretation During the Pre-trial Proceedings | 337 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 3. Translation of Documents | 338 |
| 4. Communication with Counsel | 338 |
| C. The Qualifications of the Interpreter | 339 |
| | |
| Chapter 13. The Privilege Against Self-incrimination | |
| I. Introduction | 340 |
| A. The Texts | 340 |
| B. Terminology | 341 |
| C. The Origins of the 'Privilege' | 341 |
| D. The Character of the Guarantee | 342 |
| 1. Right to Silence and the Privilege Against Self-incrimination | 342 |
| 2. Right to Silence and Freedom of Expression | 342 |
| 3. Absolute or Relative Right? | 343 |
| 4. Direct and Indirect Effects of the Guarantee | 346 |
| 5. The Rationale of the Guarantee | 347 |
| (a) The Starting Point | 347 |
| (b) The Link to Outcome-related Justice | 347 |
| (c) The Presumption of Innocence | 348 |
| (d) Respecting the Will of the Accused | 348 |
| 6. The Scope of the Guarantee | 349 |
| (a) Application <i>Ratione Materiae</i> | 349 |
| (b) Application <i>Ratione Personae</i> | 349 |
| II. The Direct Effect of the Privilege | 350 |
| A. The Right to Remain Silent | 350 |
| 1. Protection Against Immediate Physical Pressure | 350 |
| 2. Protection Against the Use of Deception | 350 |
| 3. A Right to be Warned? | 352 |
| B. The Right Not to Hand Over Documents | 353 |
| 1. The Judgment in <i>Funke v. France</i> | 353 |
| C. Exceptions | 354 |
| 1. Non-testimonial Contributions | 354 |
| 2. Disclosure of One's Identity | 354 |
| III. The Indirect Effect of the Privilege | 355 |
| A. Introduction | 355 |
| B. Adverse Inferences from Silence | 356 |
| 1. <i>John Murray v. United Kingdom</i> | 356 |
| 2. The Case-law after <i>John Murray</i> | 358 |
| 3. Assessment | 359 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| Chapter 14. The Right to Appeal | |
| I. Introduction | 360 |
| A. The Texts | 360 |
| B. The Origins | 360 |
| C. The Purpose of the Right to Appeal | 362 |
| II. The Prerequisites for the Right to Appeal | 363 |
| A. The Term 'Criminal Offence' in the Right to Appeal | 363 |
| B. The Notion of 'Conviction' in the Right to Appeal | 364 |
| C. Conviction <i>by a Tribunal</i> | 365 |
| III. The Review | 365 |
| A. The Discretion Left to the Contracting States | 365 |
| B. The 'Higher Tribunal' | 368 |
| IV. The Exceptions | 368 |
| A. Petty Offences | 368 |
| B. The Highest Court Sitting at First Instance | 370 |
| C. Conviction on Appeal after Acquittal | 371 |
| | |
| Chapter 15. The Right to Compensation for Wrongful Conviction | |
| I. The Texts | 372 |
| II. The Origins of the Guarantee | 373 |
| III. The Purpose and Significance of the Guarantee | 374 |
| IV. The Prerequisites of the Right to Compensation for Wrongful Conviction | 375 |
| A. Convicted of a Criminal Offence | 375 |
| B. A Conviction | 375 |
| C. The Conviction Must Have Been Final | 375 |
| D. The Punishment | 376 |
| E. The Execution of the Sentence | 376 |
| F. The Decision to Convict Must Have Been Set Aside | 377 |
| G. The Reversal Must be Based on New Facts | 377 |
| H. No Responsibility for Non-disclosure | 378 |
| I. The Establishment of Innocence | 378 |
| V. The Right to Compensation | 379 |
| A. The Substance of the Compensation | 379 |
| B. The Beneficiary of the Right to Compensation | 379 |
| C. According to the Law (or the Practice) of the State Concerned | 380 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| Chapter 16. The Protection Against Double Jeopardy | |
| I. Introduction | 381 |
| A. The Texts | 381 |
| B. The Origins of the Guarantee | 382 |
| II. The Aim and Purpose of the Guarantee | 383 |
| III. <i>Ne Bis In Idem</i> as an Element of the Right to a Fair Trial? | 384 |
| IV. The Scope of Application of the Guarantee | 385 |
| A. Territorial Application | 385 |
| B. The Scope of Application <i>ratione materiae</i> | 387 |
| V. The First Trial | 388 |
| A. Acquittal or Conviction | 388 |
| B. The 'Final Character' of the Decision | 389 |
| C. 'In Accordance with the Law and Penal Procedure of that State' | 390 |
| VI. The Second Trial | 391 |
| VII. Identical Offences | 391 |
| A. An Identical Aim | 392 |
| B. Same Person | 392 |
| C. Same Conduct | 392 |
| 1. 'Natural' and 'Legal' Unity of Conduct | 393 |
| 2. Conduct or Result? | 393 |
| D. The Same Offence | 394 |
| E. Is the Court's Case-law Consistent? | 394 |
| 1. <i>Gradinger and Oliveira</i> | 394 |
| 2. Consolidation of the Case-law | 396 |
| 3. Understanding Criminal Law | 396 |
| 4. Evaluation | 397 |
| 5. Proposal | 398 |
| VIII. 'Punished Again' | 399 |
| IX. The Exceptions | 400 |
| A. New Facts | 401 |
| B. Procedural Defects | 401 |
| X. Absolute Character | 402 |

 Part Four—Measures of Coercion

 Chapter 17. Liberty and Security of Person:
 The Rules on Imprisonment

| | |
|---|-----|
| I. Introduction | 405 |
| A. General Observations | 405 |
| 1. The Texts | 405 |
| 2. The Importance of Personal Liberty in Criminal Proceedings | 407 |
| 3. The Scope of the Present Chapter | 408 |
| 4. The Construction of the Guarantee | 408 |
| B. The Right Guaranteed | 408 |
| 1. The Notion of Personal Liberty | 408 |
| 2. The Notion of Security of Person | 409 |
| C. The Interference: Arrest and Detention | 412 |
| 1. The Definition | 412 |
| 2. Space | 413 |
| 3. Coercion and Waiver | 414 |
| 4. Time | 416 |
| 5. Relativity of the Notion of Deprivation of Liberty | 417 |
| II. The Exceptions to Liberty of Person | 419 |
| A. General Aspects | 419 |
| 1. The Structure of the Second Sentence of Paragraph 1 | 419 |
| 2. The Requirement of Lawfulness | 420 |
| (a) The Meaning of 'Law' in the Convention | 420 |
| (b) The Various Elements of 'Lawfulness' in Article 5 § 1 | 420 |
| (c) The Degree of Scrutiny Exercised by the Court | 421 |
| B. Detention on Remand: Article 5 § 1(c) | 423 |
| 1. Reasonable Suspicion | 423 |
| (a) The Object of the Suspicion | 425 |
| (b) The Suspicion of Having Committed an Offence | 426 |
| (c) When it is 'Reasonably Considered Necessary to Prevent [a Person] Committing an Offence' | 427 |
| (d) When it is Reasonably Considered Necessary to Prevent a Person from Fleeing after Having Committed an Offence | 428 |
| 2. The Purpose of Bringing the Person Concerned 'Before the Competent Legal Authority' | 428 |
| 3. Specific Aspects of Lawfulness of Detention on Remand | 429 |
| (a) Insufficient Certainty of the Law | 429 |
| (b) <i>Male Captus Bene Iudicatus?</i> | 431 |
| (c) Delayed Release | 433 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 4. Necessity | 434 |
| C. Detention after Conviction: Article 5 § 1(a) | 436 |
| 1. General Characteristics | 436 |
| 2. Conviction | 436 |
| (a) Definition | 436 |
| (b) Guilt | 437 |
| (c) Final Judgment | 437 |
| (d) Material Justification | 437 |
| (e) Compliance with Article 6 | 439 |
| 3. Competent Court | 440 |
| 4. The Link Between Conviction and Detention: 'After' | 440 |
| 5. The Duration of Imprisonment | 443 |
| D. Detention for Non-compliance with a Court Order or to Secure the Fulfilment of a Legal Obligation: Article 5 § 1(b) | 443 |
| 1. Detention for 'Non-compliance with the Lawful Order of a Court' | 443 |
| 2. Detention 'in Order to Secure the Fulfilment of any Obligation Prescribed by Law' | 444 |
| E. Detention of a Minor: Article 5 § 1(d) | 445 |
| 1. 'Minor' | 445 |
| 2. The Educational Purpose | 445 |
| 3. Detention of a Minor on Remand | 446 |
| 4. The Implementation of Deprivation of Liberty of a Minor | 446 |
| F. Detention for the Prevention of the Spreading of Contagious Diseases and of the Socially Maladjusted: Article 5 § 1(e) | 447 |
| 1. Detention for the Prevention of the Spreading of Infectious Diseases | 447 |
| 2. Persons of Unsound Mind | 448 |
| (a) General Observations | 448 |
| (b) The Three Prerequisites | 448 |
| (c) The Evidence for Mental Illness | 448 |
| (d) The Element of Danger | 449 |
| (e) The Element of Continuation | 450 |
| 3. The Place of Detention | 450 |
| 4. Addicts | 450 |
| 5. Vagrants | 451 |
| G. Detention to Prevent an Unauthorized Entry or with a View to Deportation or Extradition | 451 |
| 1. Detention to Prevent Unauthorized Entry | 451 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 2. Arrest or Detention with a View to Deportation or Extradition | 452 |
| (a) The Formal Character of the Exception | 452 |
| (b) Limitations to the Length of Detention under Sub-paragraph (f) | 453 |
| Chapter 18. The Rights Guaranteed to all Persons Deprived of their Liberty | |
| I. The Right to be Informed of the Reasons for the Arrest | 455 |
| A. Introduction | 455 |
| 1. The Texts | 455 |
| 2. The Purpose of the Guarantee | 456 |
| 3. The Characterization of the Right by the European Court | 456 |
| B. The Elements of the Right to Information | 457 |
| 1. The Scope of the Right to be Informed of the Reasons for the Arrest | 457 |
| 2. The Nature of the Information to be Conveyed | 457 |
| 3. The Addressee of the Information | 459 |
| 4. The Time Element | 459 |
| 5. The Form of the Information | 460 |
| II. The Right to Habeas Corpus Proceedings | 462 |
| A. Introduction | 462 |
| 1. The Texts | 462 |
| 2. The Origin and Purpose of the Right | 462 |
| (a) The Origin of the Right to Habeas Corpus Proceedings | 462 |
| (b) The Purpose of the Guarantee | 463 |
| 3. The Issues to be Discussed | 464 |
| B. The Scope of the Right to Take Habeas Corpus Proceedings | 464 |
| 1. The Autonomous Character of the Guarantee | 465 |
| 2. The Condition of Being Deprived of One's Liberty | 466 |
| 3. The Scope of Application in Time | 466 |
| (a) Immediate Applicability | 466 |
| (b) Release Pending Habeas Corpus Proceedings | 467 |
| 4. Habeas Corpus where the Detention was Ordered by a Court | 468 |
| (a) The 'Doctrine of Incorporation' | 468 |
| (b) A Further Development | 470 |
| 5. The Exceptions to the Incorporation Doctrine | 470 |
| (a) Confinement Linked to 'Unsoundness of Mind' | 470 |
| (b) Detention of Dangerous Convicts | 471 |
| (c) Sentences against Juvenile Offenders | 474 |
| (d) Detention for Non-payment of a Fine | 475 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| C. The Scope of Judicial Control under § 4 | 475 |
| 1. General Observations | 475 |
| 2. Ineffective Remedies | 476 |
| 3. Issues of National Security | 478 |
| D. Procedural Requirements | 478 |
| 1. Introduction | 478 |
| 2. The Right to Access to a Court | 479 |
| (a) Independence and Impartiality | 479 |
| (b) The Power to Release | 481 |
| 3. The Procedural Rights | 482 |
| (a) The Right to an Oral Hearing | 482 |
| (b) Equality of Arms and Adversarial Proceedings | 484 |
| (c) The Right of Access to the File | 484 |
| (d) The Right to Legal Assistance | 486 |
| (i) General Rules Concerning Access to Counsel | 486 |
| (ii) The Right to Legal-Aid Counsel | 486 |
| (e) A Presumption <i>Pro Libertate</i> ? | 487 |
| (f) A Right to Appeal? | 489 |
| (g) A Right to Submit Multiple Applications | 489 |
| 4. The Requirement of Speediness | 491 |
| (a) Issues Related to the Time Element | 491 |
| (b) An Illustration taken from the Case-law | 494 |
| (c) Plurality of Remedies | 494 |
| III. The Right to Compensation | 495 |
| A. Introduction | 495 |
| 1. The Texts | 495 |
| 2. The Origins of the Guarantee | 496 |
| 3. The Characteristics of the Right | 496 |
| B. The Prerequisites of Compensation | 497 |
| 1. Detention which is 'Unlawful'/'in Contravention' of paragraphs 1-4 of Article 5 | 497 |
| (a) In General | 497 |
| (b) Problems Occurring where the Convention is Not Yet in Force | 498 |
| (c) Procedural Problems | 498 |
| 2. Damage | 499 |
| C. The Amount of Compensation | 500 |
| Chapter 19. The Special Rights of Persons Detained on Remand | |
| I. Introduction | 502 |
| A. The Texts | 502 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| B. The Justification of Special Safeguards for those Detained on Remand | 503 |
| C. Other Safeguards | 504 |
| II. The Right to be Brought before a Judge | 505 |
| A. The Purpose and Character of the Right | 505 |
| B. The Judge or 'Other Officer Authorised by Law to Exercise Judicial Power' | 507 |
| 1. The Independence and Impartiality of the Authority | 507 |
| 2. The Power to Order Release | 510 |
| C. 'Promptly'/' <i>Aussitôt</i> ' | 511 |
| 1. The Period to be Considered | 511 |
| 2. The Time Limit | 512 |
| D. The Procedure Before the Judge | 514 |
| 1. The Need for an Oral Hearing | 514 |
| 2. The Need for Previous Information | 514 |
| 3. The Right to be Assisted by Counsel | 514 |
| 4. The Right to a Reasoned Decision | 515 |
| E. The (Ir)Relevance of Situations of Emergency | 515 |
| III. The Limitation in Time of Detention on Remand | 516 |
| A. General Remarks | 516 |
| B. The Period to be Assessed | 518 |
| 1. The Beginning of the Period | 518 |
| 2. The End of the Period | 519 |
| 3. Interruption of the Period | 521 |
| C. Criteria of Reasonableness | 521 |
| 1. 'Relevant' and 'Sufficient' Grounds for the Continuing Detention | 523 |
| (a) Danger of Absconding | 524 |
| (b) Risk of Tampering with Evidence and Suborning Witnesses | 525 |
| (c) The Risk of Collusion | 526 |
| (d) The Risk of Reoffending | 526 |
| (e) Protection of Public Order | 527 |
| (f) The Need to Protect the Applicant | 527 |
| 2. Grounds which are not Relevant or Sufficient to Justify the Continued Detention | 527 |
| (a) The Seriousness of the Alleged Offence | 527 |
| (b) The Requirements of the Inquiry | 528 |
| 3. 'Special Diligence' and the Conduct of the Proceedings | 528 |
| IV. Release on Bail | 532 |
| V. Possibility of Redress | 533 |

Chapter 20. Other Fundamental Rights Affected by Criminal Proceedings

| | |
|---|-----|
| I. Introduction | 534 |
| A. The Issues Dealt with in this Chapter | 534 |
| B. The General Approach | 534 |
| II. Interference with the Right to Respect for Private Life: General Observations | 535 |
| A. The Basic Structure of the Protection of Private Life | 535 |
| 1. The Texts | 535 |
| 2. The Elements of the Protection of Private Life | 536 |
| B. The Elements Common to the Protection of Various Aspects of Private Life | 537 |
| 1. The Requirement of Lawfulness | 537 |
| 2. The Legitimate Aim | 539 |
| 3. Necessary in a Democratic Society | 540 |
| III. Surveillance and Interception of Communications | 540 |
| A. Introduction | 540 |
| B. Interception of Written Correspondence | 542 |
| 1. The Case-law | 542 |
| 2. Principles Concerning Prisoners' Correspondence | 543 |
| IV. Technical Surveillance | 545 |
| A. The Scope of Private Life in this Context | 545 |
| B. The Interference | 546 |
| C. Special Requirements for the Legal Basis | 549 |
| D. The Scope of the Interference | 550 |
| E. 'Necessary in a Democratic Society' | 550 |
| F. Subsequent Notification | 551 |
| V. Storage of Data | 552 |
| A. Applicability of the Right to Respect for Private Life | 553 |
| B. The Interference | 554 |
| C. The Justification of the Interference | 554 |
| 1. The Legal Basis | 554 |
| 2. The Aim of the Interference | 555 |
| 3. Necessary in a Democratic Society | 555 |
| VI. Undercover Agents | 555 |
| VII. Search and Seizure: Interference with the Home | 556 |
| A. The Interference with the Right to Respect for the 'Home' | 557 |
| B. The Legal Basis | 557 |
| C. The Aim of the Interference | 558 |

| | |
|--------------------------------------|-----|
| D. Necessary in a Democratic Society | 558 |
| VIII. The Protection of Property | 559 |
| A. The Texts | 559 |
| B. Introduction | 560 |
| C. Confiscation | 560 |
| | |
| Select Bibliography | 562 |
| | |
| Index | 582 |